



0 1620 0328 2280

Bopp

BEFORE

THE NATIONAL ENERGY BOARD

IN THE MATTER OF THE NORMAN WELLS OIL PIPELINE APPLICATION

NEB ORDER OH-2-80

PUBLIC INTEREST & SOCIO-ECONOMIC MATTERS

COMMITTEE FOR JUSTICE & LIBERTY FOUNDATION

229 College Street
 Toronto, Ontario M5T 1R4

PREPARED EVIDENCE OF:

Meyer Brownstone - Director of Political Science and
 Professor of Political Science,
 University of Toronto.
 National Chairman of OXFAM-Canada.

Pam:325.3:(*41N)

PRO

POLAR
PAM
400

POLARPAM

Rec'd: Aug. 20/82
 Order No. 1
 Price: Gift
 Acc. No.: Mr. Bopp

1. Q. What is your full name and occupation?

A. My name is Meyer Brownstone. I am Director of Political Science and professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto. I am also National Chairman of OXFAM-Canada.

2. Q. Is the Curriculum Vitae attached to this evidence accurate in all respects?

A. Yes, it is.

3. Q. What is the purpose of your testimony?

A. I am appearing in my capacity as Chairman of the Board of OXFAM-Canada to explain why OXFAM-Canada has come to the conclusion that a land settlement that recognizes the aboriginal title of the Dene to their traditional lands and that invests them with the power to chart their own course for the future is consistent with the goals of social equality and justice that form the foundation of OXFAM-Canada's work.

4. Q. Please describe the perspective which has guided OXFAM-Canada's activities abroad and in Canada.

A. OXFAM-Canada has been active during the past ten years working with people in the Third World

through long-term development projects which
have confronted some of the immediate injustices
of poverty in their daily lives. Through this
direct experience in the problems of development/
underdevelopment over a number of years, a perspec-
tive for OXFAM-Canada has emerged which has shaped
our goals and programme in developing nations and
in Canada. Since its emergence after the second
World War, OXFAM has undergone a gradual transition
from an agency concerned with charity-relief work
to one whose main concern is development. This
transition has been reflected in OXFAM-Canada
since its founding in 1965. While in 1966 almost
all disbursements were made for charity-relief
work to provide food and immediate support for
the most seriously affected victims of poverty
in the Third World, by 1970 only 36% of our funds
were allocated for these purposes. (This still
represents a significant allocation of funds
since our income had increased 6-fold in the same
period.) Our major allocations by this time were
for long-term development projects with one or more
agricultural, education, family planning, health
and nutrition components. As such, this change
in approach from treating the symptoms of poverty
to a conscious attempt to alter the conditions which
produce malnutrition, hunger and disease in the
Third World broadened our awareness of the social
and political implications of all aspects of our

work. Thus while we continued to provide short-term relief support in response to situations of immediate disasters and emergencies, we have made an attempt to allocate this relief in a manner that increases the potential for long-term development. We are convinced that this experience is directly relevant to the socio-economic phase of these hearings.

Our Policy Paper on International Development in 1972 challenges the more traditional understanding of this term 'development' and poses an alternative conception.

..."development amounts to a great deal more than increases in gross domestic product, per capita incomes, per capita railway mileage, etc. and development cannot be left solely in the hands of the economists. The overall aim of development is to bring into being a society in which the available resources are shared by the people on an equitable basis. There are two weaknesses in this definition. Firstly, it is not clear who is to be responsible for bringing about these changes in the society and on this matter there should be no doubt. Secondly, to the materialistically minded westerner, the term 'resource' too often suggests only

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2022 with funding from
University of Alberta Libraries

a material and static thing, whereas the term encompasses people in all their variety and especially their culture."

In the projects we support OXFAM-Canada has worked with the poorest sections of the population in both rural and urban areas in their efforts to realize their aspirations for social justice and greater equality within their own societies. The notion of social justice must be tempered with the recognition that one of the central causes of underdevelopment is the existence of indigenous and external elites who use their economic and political power to impose 'development priorities' which strengthen their own positions within a developing society. In other words, the poorest sections, at the socio-economic margin, who daily face the conditions of material poverty, also lack the political power to realize their interests in a more just and equitable social order. It is for this reason that OXFAM seeks to support indigenously determined self-help projects that on a long-term basis confront the most immediate conditions of poverty amongst the marginalized and exploited population. By creating the conditions for relative self-reliance, such projects may also develop the self-confidence and awareness of the oppressed to assert their longer-term interests in the national political, eco-

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30

economic and social spheres. Along with this understanding comes the realization that any nationwide amelioration of the conditions of poverty requires a thorough-going change in social and economic structures that sustain dependency and exploitation. Development projects do not in themselves generate such structural transformations. What they can do is create the awareness of their necessity and offer a model for real alternatives.

5. Q. What influence has OXFAM-Canada's international work had on its domestic projects?

A. The transformation in the nature and the understanding of our work overseas has also been reflected in the development of our programme in Canada. This programme increasingly has come to recognize the importance of education and political action work. Public education programmes have been developed in the three regions of OXFAM-Canada in order to broaden the awareness of Canadians of the dimensions and causes of poverty, malnutrition and illiteracy in the Third World. But equally important, the thrust of these programmes have also emphasized the importance of effecting changes in Canadian government policy towards the Third World. Ultimately such policy changes in Canada's economic relations with the developing nations can effect a more significant

challenge to the structures that sustain underde-
velopment than relief aid or welfare oriented
development assistance.

OXFAM's education and political action programmes
have generated a response among Canadians not only
because of a humanitarian concern but also because
we feel Canadians share a common ground with those
seeking social justice in the Third World. Just as
powerful external economic elites have distorted
development in the Third World, these same elites
in the industrial nations have distorted their own
economies, most prominently through the agencies
of global corporations supported by large govern-
ments. As a resource hinterland for metropolitan
industrial nations, this distortion has also occur-
red in Canada. The most obvious victims of this
process of development have been Canada's native
people as well as the urban and rural poor. Their
situation is characterized by those same conditions
of underdevelopment that we have experienced in
the Third World. And it is for this reason that
material and other support for these groups are
consistent with OXFAM's aims and objectives.

6. Q. When did OXFAM-Canada begin working with Canada's
Native people?

A. OXFAM-Canada's involvement with Canadian Native

people goes back to 1970, the year in which we
funded Project Talking Bird. OXFAM paid for the
purchase of a small airplane operated under the
direction of the Canadian Association in Support
of Native Peoples. We also funded some running
cost. This plane was used to do initial organi-
zation work in both Western and Eastern Arctic
communities, especially among the Inuit.

The idea was to put isolated native communities in
touch with one another. They would then discover
that the concerns they had about how modernization
was coming to the North, or what place they would
have in the future northern society, were concerns
that other communities shared. With this know-
ledge and communication, native people could begin
to assert their right to participate in making
decisions which will affect their lives and the
lives of their children.

Project Talking Bird was especially useful in
helping to build local affiliates of the Inuit
Tapirisat of Canada (I.T.C.) in the eastern Arctic.

This initial involvement with Canada's native
people in 1970 was motivated by a genuine humani-
tarian response to their plight, by a concern for
their physical and psychological oppression. But
this concern was sharpened in the years following

in the awareness that the causes of poverty,
hunger, malnutrition, etc. among native people
in Canada were remarkably similar to the causes
underlying underdevelopment in the Third World.

7. Q. What similarities do you identify as underlying the
causes of underdevelopment in the Third World and
in Canada's North?

A. Just as the societies and economies of indigenous
peoples in the Third World had been disrupted,
distorted and weakened during the periods of con-
quest, colonialism and neo-colonialism by the inter-
vention of the industrial countries seeking re-
sources for their own interest, so too in Canada
the appropriation of land resources by companies,
governments, and individuals led to the distortion,
disruption and eventual destruction of the indi-
genous economies and societies of Canada's native
people. They were pushed aside in the process
of nation-building and profit-building, sometimes
exterminated, sometimes conquered, more often
forced onto reserves and put under the charge of
the Federal Government. The colonisation of the
Third World has had its parallel in this country.
What is most unsettling however is that this
internal colonialism directed at the native people
of Canada has not ended, even in the present day.
It is in this context that OXFAM-Canada saw

that its experience and policies in encouraging development among communities in the Third World were directly relevant to a similar challenge among Canadian native people.

8. Q. Has OXFAM-Canada offered other forms of support to native organizations?

A. In 1974, the National Indian Brotherhood sought OXFAM's help to prepare for an international conference of Aboriginal Peoples. The meeting would bring together Lapps from Scandinavia, Aborigines from Australia, Indians from North and South America, Inuit from the Arctic, Bushmen from Africa, etc. It would bring together representatives from all these groups to exchange information and strategies about their common problems as 'small peoples' trying to survive and develop, surrounded by a dominant society of invaders.

In the same year, the Indian Brotherhood of the N.W.T., now the Dene Nation, also approached OXFAM. They were determined to seek a land settlement in the N.W.T. different from all previous native land settlements. They sought a continuing role in both the planning and the benefits of developing their ancient Northern homeland. The mechanism for ensuring themselves of a place in the future economic, social and political life

of Canada's North would be continuing ownership of their land. All previous Canadian treaties with native people, up to and including the James Bay Settlement, have been instruments for extinguishing aboriginal rights to the land. The result of this extinguishment was that the dominant non-native Canadian Society pushed ahead with its own kind of 'development' while native people became outcasts and pensioners.

9. Q. What considerations led OXFAM-Canada to respond to the proposal of the Dene people?

A. OXFAM-Canada was attracted by several aspects of the proposal put forward by the Dene people. First it was a grass roots movement -- the impetus and demand for this kind of a land settlement came from the communities. The near universal support for such an approach was shown first by the response of the hundreds of individuals who appeared before the Mackenzie Valley Pipeline Inquiry when it visited native communities in 1975 and 1977. This support has continued to the present, in spite of persistent government neglect of the demands of the Dene Nation.

Secondly, the Dene have made a significant breakthrough in uniting the status, non-status and Metis people of the N.W.T. In most parts of Canada

'treaty' Indians keep themselves separated from 'non-status' and Metis people. This division is promoted and encouraged by the policy of our federal government which refuses to deal with these groups as one. In the N.W.T. the Dene made it clear from the start that they sought a settlement for all people of Indian ancestry. So strongly did they make this point that the Federal Government agreed for the first time in modern Canadian history to negotiate with both groups together. And now the Dene Nation has been recognized as the one and only representative for negotiating land claims for all people of Dene descent in the Valley.

Thirdly and lastly, OXFAM-Canada was asked to support only those segments of the Indian Brotherhood's work which the Federal Government had refused to fund. In June 1975, OXFAM agreed to a project grant of \$140,000 over a two-year period to fund economic studies related to a land claim settlement in the N.W.T. Part of that grant was used to pay for independent analysis of the economic potential of land under claim.

Because the Berger Inquiry demanded all available Dene resources, OXFAM's project underwent considerable revision. But the basic objective - to allow the Dene to develop their own concepts of com-

community-based development remained. By deciding what kind of development they want, they would be able to work out the specific nature of the land settlement that would be needed to make it possible. In this way they would be sure that development alternatives would be compatible with their own lifestyle and needs.

It is our understanding that this process continues within the Dene Nation. A process by which people themselves endeavour to take control over their own lives and future is necessarily a time-consuming one. But aboveall, the process remains frustrated by the refusal of the Federal Government to recognize their aboriginal rights and their right to self-determination within Canada. The recognition of these rights is fundamental to the positive process of development and growth the Dene are undertaking. As long as the Federal Government withholds this recognition and fails to negotiate a land settlement based on these principles, the Dene will remain beset by the social and economic stagnation they now suffer. The Dene position of "no development before a land settlement" is surely a demand which must be respected, even when it involves smaller projects like the Norman Wells oilfield expansion and pipeline project.

Consistent with OXFAM-Canada's desire to develop

an educational programme around its major projects,
we appointed a full-time staff member in July 1975
to act as a liaison person between OXFAM and the In-
dian Brotherhood of the N.W.T. The responsibility
of the liaison officer was to examine the situation
in the Mackenzie Valley through direct experience
in the field and to translate that understanding
into an education programme for southern Canadians
in the Province of Ontario. The programme began
in October 1975 and continued intensively until
the NEB decision on the Mackenzie Valley pipeline
in 1977. Since then, OXFAM has continued its policy
of responding to requests for support from the
Dene Nation as required.

10. Q. What observations can you draw from OXFAM-Canada's
work with native people?

A. Our involvement in the Mackenzie Valley since 1974
has given OXFAM-Canada the opportunity to analyze
the dynamics of development in the region and to
articulate, with the benefit of our experience
elsewhere, what conditions are essential if social
equality and justice are to be guaranteed to the
Dene of the North. An independent economic base
suited to the present capacities of the native
people of the Mackenzie Valley and sufficient to
provide for both their present and their future de-
velopment is one condition that is absolutely ne -

cessary. The second is a measure of self-determination that will allow the Dene to determine their own development priorities and that will at the same time secure their direct participation in other development decisions within the region.

Land and self-determination have existed for the Dene through most of their history and even in large measure in the present day. They continue to have a land base and the control they have had de facto over this land has allowed them to maintain their economy and the society which is built on it. Government policy and corporate activity has often weakened the integrity of their way of life, but the fact that this externally initiated development has been in the past sporadic rather than comprehensive, has given the Dene the space to keep their society together and to avoid the symptoms of social disintegration that have been the fate of native people in southern Canada. Even with industrial training and employment programmes and government education systems, the Dene remain marginalized from the development process in the Mackenzie Valley. It has been their good fortune that thus far this process has not engulfed the north, that industry and government have ignored this last frontier sufficiently to leave a margin big enough for the Dene to sustain themselves on their own resources.

11. Q. Are you optimistic that this margin will be maintained in the future?

A. No, because the conquest of the last frontier has now begun. Between 1975 and 1977, the Dene were threatened by the Mackenzie Valley natural gas pipeline proposals. Now they are threatened by the Norman Wells project. We have been told that this present project is "small" and "minor", but after years of government intransigence on the land settlement and aboriginal rights issues - no development project is small or insignificant to the Dene. Development of northern energy reserves and exploitation of northern mineral resources of which the Norman Wells project is a part, threatens to destroy the margin that has underwritten the Dene's survival up to now. That erosion comes in the form of direct destruction of their economic base as the wildlife, the fish, the terrain, the air, in short, the renewable resources on which they depend suffer under the environmental damage of development projects. But it also comes (and perhaps more significantly) in the form of social impacts as diverse as alcoholism, family break down and violence on the one hand; and on the other, employment that draws people away from the land and away from their communities only to throw them back there when employment opportunities dry up. Government policy as it relates to northern native people gives no basis for hope

that this process will be reversed. The mandate of the Department of Indian and Northern Affairs -- to extinguish the Dene's aboriginal title in exchange for reserves and monetary compensation -- does not offer an economic base capable of supporting Dene society. The protected lands will be too small, usufructory rights on unprotected lands will lose their value as 'development' decimates renewable resources, and monetary compensation, insufficient to begin with, will not come within an integrated development plan worked out by the Dene necessary to maximize its usefulness. Moreover, the chronic failure of government programmes directed at assimilating native people within the dominant, non-native society, closes off what might be an alternative source for the satisfaction of the material, if not the social and cultural needs, of the Dene. The future of the Dene under a land settlement as it is being advanced by the Federal Government will be little different from what is now the present-day reality for most native people in southern Canada -- unproductive reserves, emigration to the metropolitan centres; in both places welfare, alcoholism, violence, suicide, demoralization. The injustice of this situation is inescapable. The need for an alternative is clear.

12. Q. What conditions do you believe necessary to minimize future social impact of development on the Dene?

A. A land settlement that recognizes the aboriginal title of the Dene to their traditional lands and that invests them with the power to chart their own course for the future is an alternative, consistent with the goals of social equality and justice that form the foundation of OXFAM-Canada's work. This demand by the Dene to control their own lives and to chart their own future course constitutes the essence of the Dene Declaration, we believe, and the reason why OXFAM-Canada strongly supports it. The land will provide the material base, and the self-determination will provide the institutional foundation for the Dene to meet their development needs. Without the latter, power over the lives of the Dene will continue to rest in the hands of Canadian governments which have consistently shown themselves -- whether through ignorance or insensitivity -- to be incapable of wielding power beneficially. Political rights that give the Dene control over development on an on-going basis in the Mackenzie Valley must be fundamental to any just land settlement. Without ownership of the land and of the rights to its renewable and non-renewable resources, the self-determination of the Dene will lack an economic base. Both land and self-determination are important; both are necessary.

The alternatives are clear. This is not a debate about legalities, but about social justice. The

history of colonialism and exploitation, whose
consequences are so evident in the Third World,
and regrettably are also evident in the treatment
of native people in Canada, must not be repeated
in the Mackenzie Valley. For what this Board's
decision will affect is not only the right to cul-
tural survival of the Dene, but their material and
social survival as well. As basic human rights,
these must be guaranteed to them.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30

Date Due

NOV 19 '87			
DEC 3 '87			

49402

Pam:325.3: (*41N)
BRO

BROWSTONE, MEYER

Before the National Energy Board
in the matter of the Norman Wells

TITLE
oil pipeline application

DATE LOANED	BORROWER'S NAME	DATE DUE
	<i>Glenn L. ...</i>	NOV 19 '87
	RENEWAL	DEC 3 '87

49402

BOREAL INSTITUTE FOR NORTHERN STUDIES, LIBRARY
THE UNIVERSITY OF ALBERTA
EDMONTON, ALBERTA T6G 2E9
CANADA

University of Alberta Library



0 1620 0328 2280